



MINUTES

PUBLIC HEARING ON AMENDMENTS TO 85-3 4.9.4 REGARDING THE PERMITTED NUMBER OF SWINE AND THE REGULAR TOWN COUNCIL MEETING

WEDNESDAY, MARCH 17th, 2021 AT 6:30 P.M.

Council Members Present: Mayor Duncan and Council Members: Gibson, Hill, Holland and O'Brien.

Absent: None

Others Present: Ron Drake, Bruce Keeler, Matt Langer, Eric Secrist, Darin Menlove, Jeff Whitney, Tom and Donna Wood, Russ Cooper, Alice Drogin, Devon Dixon, Jason and Ali Matz, Norman and Peggy Llewelyn, Jayne May, Janie Tuft, Don Montoya, Franz Thoma. John Groo. Planning and Land Use Commission: Ryan Anderson, Colleen Thompson, Marie Hawkins and Julie Baird.

Clerk: Jocelyn Buck

M Duncan delivered the Electronic Meeting Determination

Roll Call

Public Hearing called to Order at 6:30PM

Amendments to Ordinance 85-3 Section 4.9.4 regarding the permitted numbers of Swine.

Written Comments are posted separately on the Public Notice website and "Z" drive Mtg Packets.

Tom Wood- email comments submitted. Provided that swine are going to be raised in the Valley he would like to see setbacks used to mitigate impacts to neighbors. He suggested a 250 lbs. tipping weight on feeder sub adults because if raised up to 18 months some larger breeds could be the same size as an adult but they would still count for .20 animal units. And that could be a way some could crowd in more animals per lot.

Donna Wood- email comments submitted. Would like to speak later.

Bruce Keeler-email comments submitted. When the extra animal CUP was throw out with it went a whole list of setbacks and procedures for taking care of animals that should be re-incorporated into the livestock management in this Ordinance. With those incorporated the previously discussed number of 4 adult swine would not be a big impact.

Ali Matz- email comments submitted. The Town Grocery store shelves could be empty that is why they resound sustainability and wanted the Council and Community to consider again and push for preserving and protecting their ability to farm sustainably and be able to have a healthy non inbred bloodline. She echoed Keeler's comments regarding good management practices and setbacks to help protect the neighbors.

Marie Hawkins- Personally would like to see 3 pigs and 3 feeders, she thought we are getting away from the original intend for (to protect) air and the water. It's hard to find the fine line, pigs were done first because that is what was on the survey and was the most contentious thing. Now we are down to getting a compromise that works for everybody between no pigs and 30 pigs. Three pigs one boar and two sows seems to work for most people, there is no reason to make limits for more than what people are doing. We cannot be 100 % sustainable out here anyway but everybody is entitled to raise animals to provide for their family and maybe give some to their neighbors.

Jayne May Thanked the Planning Commission for all their work on this difficult subject, marrying the survey, general plan and management plan together is no simple feat. She supports 3 adults and 3 sub adults and she is a strong believer in the family farm in our Community. She lives next door to some of the most conscientious farmers in the Valley other residents may not be as fortunate. Setbacks do not make a fail-safe system there are multiple impacts to having animals and the different sensitivities to those impacts in a neighborhood. Looking at animal units charts she is concerned about the quantity of

animals currently permitted on each lot. It is going to take a third party “un fair to rest” to manage the animals units and mitigate the effects neighbors to neighbors. She cannot imagine being in another position where they are constantly managing permitted uses on neighboring properties that are not as well run as the one next to her. She supports 3/3.

Tasslo Thoma The weight categories were unreasonable and 3 pigs is not enough to raise bacon, you have to have a pig that is at least a year old to have bacon. The biggest thing (problem) with all the language is regulation we don't have anybody going around checking setbacks and structures for animals need to be 70 feet from the property line. There is no way to hold anybody accountable it is only going to be neighbors ratting out neighbors and then the authorities will come down and check on it. Another problem is some lots are different sizes and have different conditions why is a 6 acre lot being held to the same limits as a 4 acre lot. The limit is way too low, not sustainable, you won't be able to raise pigs without inbreeding and you won't get any bacon. He agreed with Matz and Keeler's comments and supported four adult pigs.

Ryan Anderson The numbers proposed for permitted numbers of swine fit the parameters the PLUC members found in their exhaustive research and also fit the Castle Valley General Plan. Given more time and Q and A the PLUC may have come to the same numbers as has been proposed now.

Devon Dixon No Comment

Donna Wood Appreciated all the work the PLUC and the Community has done. There has been a lot of good information and data, from Ali Matz and Deb Holling in particular. Based on everything three adult pigs seems to be a solid consensus.

Darin Menlove Disagreed that 3 is not a consensus, a consensus letter has been circulated (to those raising pigs) proposing four adults. In our Town there is agreement on one thing and that is the number of swine should be reduced from 30. Those of us that are raising swine sustainably the ability to keep the line going there is a huge difference between 3 and 4. The number that works is 4 and that is a significant reduction from 30.

Colleen Thompson Pointed out that the current Ordinance the permitted number of large animals is eight, so eight adult swine. It is the medium sized animal category that permits 30 animals that would be for juvenile pigs up to market weight.

M Duncan Asked the Council if they had any questions for clarification.

CM Gibson Asked how many adult pigs you would need for a breeding program. Previously Jeff Whitney had explained this as well as how the big pigs are the ones you get bacon from.

Jeff Whitney Explained that boars get really big so you only keep a boar about 3 years. Sows get large but you keep them 2-3 times longer, there is a point were you cannot breed a large sow with a small boar and there is cross over point were a younger boar would end up being older than what we are classifying as a feeder pig but not ready to breed your sows. You need to have some overlap between the large boar (that ends up being sausage after a few years) and the smaller replacement boar in order to breed your sows. A smaller replacement sow cannot be bred to that large boar but could be bred by the smaller replacement boar. You would need 4 adult pigs to do this rotation in a conscientious way to ensure your boars and sow as are healthy. That is the number unless you have a neighbor that can provide that interim boar.

CM Gibson asked if this is true with the smaller breeds.

Whitney responded that you would need the bigger pigs to get bacon, you won't get bacon from Kuni kunis or pasture pigs but still some type of rotation/replacement would also be necessary with the smaller breeds.

CM Holland – Asked Whitney how having only three pigs would affect the blood lines and keeping the bloodlines healthy.

Whitney Explained that you cannot back breed/ breed relative pigs you have to bring in new bloodlines with replacement pigs. And have to have that 4th pig in order to raise up that replacement boar. In reality one pig breeder could supply many people in the Valley with feeder pigs. Everybody is not going to be breeding pigs, breeding pigs takes a lot of equipment and preparation. It has to done both in an economical and ethical way. Pigs can have 2 litters a year.

Matt Langer Added that transporting the boar around the valley for breeding is not easy it is a difficult operation and someone got hurt the last time they did it.

CM Hill Asked for clarification so if a less than 450 lb. pig is .60 Animal Unit (A.U.) then should a larger than 450lbs pigs have a higher A.U. Whitney said that most feeder pigs are butchered at around 250 lbs. Most breeds it takes about 5 months for a feeder pig to reach 250 lbs. but this also would depend on what they are being fed.

Tom Wood A solution to breeding pigs would be that a couple breeders in the Valley could have a sustainable operation with 4 adult and they could supply feeders to their neighbors. And there could be a maximum of seven pigs either 4/3 or 3/4 adults/ feeders.

Colleen Thompson explained that the reasoning behind a higher animal unit number (A.U.) for bigger pigs was because they produce more waste (per Rhonda Miller State Ag Dept.) And it is not fair to compare 3 adult American Guineas to 3 of the larger breed adults. Having a lower A.U. number for the smaller breeds would encourage people to have the smaller breeds as well as allow them to have more animals.

Marie Hawkins Supported Wood's proposal of seven total, she thought that was a good compromise. And she thanked Jeff Whitney for the education.

M Duncan closed the Public Hearing at 7:24 PM

Regular Town Meeting

M Duncan called the Meeting to order at 7:24 PM

1. Open Public Comment: None

2. Approval of Minutes: 2.17.2021 Regular Town Council Meeting

CM Holland motioned to approve the Minutes from 2.17.2021, CM Gibson seconded, motion passed unanimously.

3. Executive Reports:

*Water Agent and Water Committee Report - John Groo reported the Water Advisory Committee did not meet this month. There were a couple of applications for well permits. CM O'Brien reported in the MAPN Meeting the Geyser Road Project planned on using a toxic herbicide in the road base. MAPN will write a letter asking them not to use a herbicide. There was discussion and information from USGS and UGS on the Moab water table down at the wetlands. If Moab's water table drops there will not be enough water pressure to keep the brine down and it could seep up into the wetlands.

*Roads Committee- M Duncan-Minutes and Reports provided. Grading has started Cliffview, Meadow and Chamisa have been done.

*Planning & Land Use Commission-Colleen Thompson- Minutes provided. No questions.

*Community Renewable Energy Act.-CM Gibson gave an update; Castle Valley could become an anchor Community for \$500 instead of \$200 sign up fee. They have the five anchor Communities to cover start-up costs/ fill in the gaps until others join but the more anchor Communities the better. Moab and Grand County are considering being an anchor Communities. Christopher Thomas could come and give a presentation on the Program at our April Meeting. CM Hill wanted a discussion item on the anchor community on the April Agenda. The Governance Agreement will be made available to the Council next week.

*Solid Waste District- nothing to report.

*EMS District- Ed Weeks- not present.

*Fire District-Chief Drake reported there have been two fires recently one was a power pole fire, the other was a brush fire. This just shows how dry it is already, the rain we have had since will help a lot.

*Housing Task Force- M Duncan- Minutes provided.

*County Economic Advisory Board-M Duncan- Minutes provide.

* Dark Sky Team – Buck reported Harry Holland, Colleen Thompson, Tom Haraden, Faylene Roth, Nate Ament and herself have formed the Team and have had their first Meeting. They will be starting work on the Lighting Ordinance and support Letters. CM Holland added that he will send the Council a draft list of potential support entities to get any additional contacts and/or contact information.

4. Correspondence: David Vaughn email re: Rocky Mountain Power bumps. M Duncan had a discussion with Dan Vink (RMP) on the recent power bumps. Dan will come to the April Meeting to update the Community on issues and future plans.

5. Administrative Matters & Procedures: No Town letters needed, PLUC Workshop will be held ahead of the PLUC Meeting on 4.7.2021. Council has questions for discussion at the Workshop. Spring Clean-up canceled; the next regular Spring Clean-up will in 2022. Gourd Festival questions/ discussion entailed whether gatherings would be viable by fall. M Duncan asked the Council what criteria the Council would consider as to when we can begin to have "in person" meetings. It was agreed that it depended on the vaccine roll out and if everyone would get the vaccine. It was agreed that if the Council did go back to in person meetings there should be a way the public can safely join and participate the meeting virtually . It was too early for making any plans for meetings and the Gourd Festival at this time. The Festival is outside but the Fire Station potluck would not be possible due to COVID.

NEW BUSINESS

6. Discussion and Possible Action re: Sponsoring the Community Recycle Center.

CM Hill stated that the Recycle Center is a great Community resource, the Council agreed.

CM Hill motioned to support the Community Recycle Center at the Gold level of \$500. CM Gibson seconded, motion passed unanimously

UNFINISHED BUSINESS-

7. Discussion and Possible Action re: Proposed amendments to Ordinance 85-3 Section 4.9.4 regarding numbers of swine (tabled).

CM Hill motioned to untable Item 7, CM O'Brien seconded, motion passed unanimously.

CM O'Brien thought that taking into consideration options for breeding programs and the raising swine for food, 7 swine with either option of 3 /4 or 4/3 brood stock adults to feeders would be ok.

CM Holland thanked the PLUC for all their work as well as the Community for their input, since joining the Council he has never had so much input and information to sift through. He would be ok with 4/4 but compromise is part of this process. He would support 4 adults because of the information received on what would be the minimum number for an adequate breeding program. He added that once the numbers are settled there are some of the smaller details and language that need work.

CM Gibson added the whole idea of this was to reduce the number of pigs from 30. She recognized and supports people that live here and want to raise their own food. They may be the minority but they should be considered. If pigs are raised correctly they should not be a public nuisance. She agreed that there was a compelling reason to have 4 adults for a breeding program. And 4 sub adults for a total of 8 pigs was a good number.

CM Hill commented that this is a very diverse Community and compromise will be necessary to get through this issue. She supports small farming in this Community, but she also believes everyone has the right to enjoy their own property and should not be stuck indoors because of the stench or other controllable nuisances. She agreed that having two categories of pigs is appropriate and that 4 brood stock and 3 sub adults was a good compromise. In addition, only one sow should be bred at once Hill thanked the PLUC for all their work on the Ordinance and apologized for being short and rude at the last meeting she meant no disrespect to the PLUC.

M Duncan thanked the PLUC for the time they worked on the Ordinance. Land use regulations take property rights away from the public and the Utah Code requires us to take the minimum necessary for public health and safety. M Duncan also agreed to either the 4/4 or 4/3 adult to sub adults. She added that Keeler's suggestion that the conditions from the old CUP should be worked back into our standards. Prior to this issue she did not even know how many people had pigs in Valley because they were being managed so well. Council discussion went back and forth on whether to add another weight category for larger pigs +450 lbs. and they would have a higher animal unit number but could still be fit into allowed 8 large animals per plotted lot equation. However since actual weights of pigs cannot be adequately measured why add it as a new category. The concern was that larger pigs will create more waste but if that could be mitigated with proper management practices size would not be enough of an issue to substantiate a new weight category. Enforcement of numbers of swine will realistically be simply a matter of counting heads not weights and/ or categorical Hill proposed 4 adults/4 sub adults, only breeding one sow at a time or having one litter at a time,

removing any weight category for adults and removing butcher weight age limit. CM O'Brien preferred 4/3 or 3/4, adult /sub adult combinations no more than 7 pigs total. However that Ordinance language could be complicated to enforce. Concern was raised that limiting to 3 sub adults is reducing the whole purposed which is raising pigs for food. However litters raised one at a time over a year would still allow for the raising multiples of 3 sub adults to butcher weight. Discussion continued on the rationale behind having an age limit on butcher weight sub adults that takes into account small breed pigs. This age limit could allow for a sub adult to get larger than a brood stock pig but have the animal unit allowance of .20 instead of .60. Still hard to determine and enforce realistically it is better to just have a total of 7 pigs with 4/3 or 3/4 combinations.

CM Hill motioned the underlined:

4.9.4 Animal Unit Chart An animal and offspring shall be considered to be one animal until six months after the birth of the offspring. Exception swine: piglets shall be considered as separate animals at weaning and be classified as sub adults. No more than 7 swine total shall be allowed as a permitted use on each legally platted lot.

Large Sized Adults over 6 months of Age. No more than 8 large sized animals from this category shall be allowed as a permitted use on each legally platted lot. Of which no more than 4 large sized animals shall be adult brood stock swine and allowing for only one litter of (suckling) piglets at a time.

Medium Sized Non-Swine Adults over 6 Months of Age and Weaned Sub adult. No more than 30 medium sized animals from this category shall be allowed as a permitted use on each legally platted lot. Exception no more than 4 medium sized animals shall be non brood stock sub adult swine raised to butcher weight appropriate for their breed not to exceed 18 months of age.

Adult swine 450 lbs. weight category removed

Adult swine animal unit = .6

Swine sub adult animal unit = .20

CM O'Brien seconded, motion passed unanimously.

8. Discussion and Possible Action re: Adopting Resolution 2020-1Town written Policy Positions (tabled).

CM Holland motioned to untable Item 8, CM O'Brien seconded, motion passed unanimously.

CM Holland motioned to approve Resolution 2020-1 Town written Policy Positions, CM Hill seconded motion passed unanimously.

9. Discussion and Possible Action re: Complaint Resolution process (tabled). Left tabled

10. Closed Meeting (If necessary)

11. Payment of the bills.

CM Hill asked to have the Clerk go ahead and pay the Sponsorship for the Recycle Center \$500 as it was approved in Item 6.

CM Gibson motioned to pay the bills, CM O'Brien seconded, motion passed unanimously

ADJOURNMENT

CM Hill motioned to adjourn, CM Holland seconded, motion passed unanimously.

M Duncan adjourned the Meeting at 8:50 PM

Approved:



Jazmine Duncan, Mayor

Date: 4.23.2021

Attested:



Jocelyn Buck, Town Clerk

Date: 4.23.2021